

中國熊場與熊膽產製品非法交易

答客問 Q & A

什麼是熊膽?其用途為何?

膽汁是一種由肝所分泌的液體，儲存於膽囊內，是消化過程中，不可或缺的一部份。傳統中藥使用熊膽已超過三千年之久，通常是將少量熊膽和其他藥材混合使用，用來治療多種疾病，包括消化不良、胃部、腎臟問題和身體發燒等。

什麼是熊場?

熊被囚禁圈養，大部分是關在窄小的籠子內，腹部有一個被切開的傷口，讓熊的膽汁每天都可以透過一個導管"滴"出來。典型的情況是，熊被個別關在約 1 x 1 x 2 公尺的籠子裡，通常身體無法伸直，時間長達數年。

熊因為熊膽而被'養殖'著，養殖者為了換得更多利益而抽取大量熊膽汁。只要他們還活著，熊終其一生將會被利用在膽汁的取得上。

有多少熊被關在熊場?

在中國，大約有七千隻熊分別養殖於兩百個左右的熊場。在南韓，有一千四百隻熊因數年前政府禁止「囚熊抽膽」，而遺留在熊場內。不過仍有部分熊場非法繁育，或為了非法交易而殺熊。另外越南也有熊場，估計共有一千五百隻熊，雖然在越南擁有或養殖熊是不合法的。

膽汁是怎麼從熊的身上取得的?

大部分熊場使用金屬或塑膠管，或導管，以手術的方式植入熊的膽囊，以便膽汁從膽囊導流到體外。為了取得膽汁，排液管長期不停反覆開關，導致熊腹部的傷口永遠無法癒合。有些熊場還會將熊的肚子周圍套上「鐵甲」，以防熊將管子抓開。

導管是經由手術切開熊的腹部，再值入熊的膽囊。WSPA 的訪查人員發現，許多熊場的手術是由未曾受過專業訓練的人員，在不衛生的環境之下實施的。

有些熊場使用「組織性瘻管」來取代金屬導管，這樣可以讓膽汁以滲透的方式滴出體外，號稱「自由滴漏」（free dripping）。熊場一天抽取熊膽汁一次到兩次，以塑膠或金屬條插入導管，讓膽汁順著滴入瓶子或罐子裡。

熊場如何處理膽汁？

每隻熊每天被榨取一到兩次後，大約會滴出 100 毫升（ml）的膽汁。熊場將這些深褐/綠色的液體烘乾成結晶（粉粒）狀後，裝入小玻璃瓶和盒子裡販賣，或是中藥商買來加入其他成分調製後出售。許多熊場擁有屬於他們自己的藥廠，以自創品牌向遊客兜售。

熊如何在這些熊場受苦？

熊屬於野生動物，將他們囚禁在籠子使他們無法坐立或轉身，無庸置疑是不人道的。當熊的膽汁被抽取時，他們會痛苦地顫慄、發抖、哀嚎；而在抽取之後，他們會在籠子裡因疼痛而搔抓或捧著腹部，搖晃著頭和身體。

許多熊承受著因手術所導致的痛楚，像導管口發炎；膿、血、膽汁由傷口滲出。熊場的報告指出，約有五至六成的熊會因導管植入膽囊手術所引起的併發症死亡。而許多生存下來的熊，則要忍受著敞開的傷口、腫瘤、內臟腫瘤、膽結石、腹膜炎、疝氣、脫腸、敗血症，等等相關病痛。

部分的熊會被拔掉指甲、牙齒。許多的熊則會因痛苦而咬著籠子欄杆，其後果是承受蛀牙等嚴重的牙齒病痛。餵養熊的食物則是粗劣的，通常是缺乏維他命的玉米泥。另外，水也不是經常性供給。

中國政府不停宣稱他們正在改善養殖熊的動物福利，也成立了幾個政府'示範'熊場。這些熊場號稱擁有最好的圈養設備給熊居住，包括榨取膽汁的小籠子與可以通往室外的大

籠子。然而，室外區域的展示用途，遠大於實際的運用，而且在冬天的時候，養殖熊都是被關在籠子裡的。另外，大部分的熊場仍使用著狹小的籠子。世界動物保護協會（WSPA）相信，活生生的由動物身上抽取膽汁，無論如何是件不人道的事。

熊場是一種中國傳統嗎？

不是，熊的養殖在 1980 年代初才開始，技術與作法係由北韓引進。

中國政府和熊場主人反覆訴求『使用熊膽和熊膽汁是傳統中藥文化的一部份』。事實上，依照中國林業部（Chinese Ministry of Forestry）的資料，在 1980 年之前，所有中藥業者對於熊膽的需求量每年僅五百公斤。但是，在 1988 年之後，由熊場所出產的乾熊膽量卻攀升到每年七千公斤，中國當地的使用量便佔了其中四千公斤。

近年來，熊膽產品的出產量有更明顯的成長，市場上並出現了新系列的產品，例如洗髮精、酒、茶等，早已不是傳統中藥。

熊場的熊可活多久？

平均最多約為十年，此為野生熊隻平均壽命的三分之一。

野生動物保育關心哪些問題？

熊場不只提高了熊膽汁的供應量，也因此提升其需求量。由於它所帶來的高利潤與大量生產上的便利，熊膽汁在市場上被大量推銷。刺激熊場膽汁的需求量，則對野生熊類造成更大的威脅，更多的野生熊隻將被獵殺或捕捉，以取代在熊場死亡的熊隻。

為取得熊膽，必須殺死熊隻，獵取熊膽最通常的方式是在野外獵殺熊隻。因為野生熊膽被認為比飼養熊膽（汁）更有療效，在中國大陸因此造成了野生數量的急遽下降，IUCN 熊類專家團估計全中國大陸野生的熊隻僅存 20000 隻。

熊膽汁有無替代品 ？

有. 許多中醫師表示於今時今日中藥並無須使用熊膽汁. 市面上有許多較低價且療效良好的替代品, 同樣含有在熊膽中所發現的有效成分 -- 稱為熊去氧膽酸(UDCA). 估計每年中國大陸, 日本與南韓共消耗 100,000 公斤的合成 UDCA. 全世界的消耗量應該是此數的一倍. 此外, 最少有 75 種草藥可替代熊膽汁。

中國是否將關閉熊場 ？

毫無跡象顯示中國大陸計畫減少熊場中的熊隻數量。事實上, 中國政府只是意圖減少小型熊場, 卻以飼養上百或上千熊隻的"超級熊場"取而代之。

90 年代初期, 中國大陸有 600 多個熊場, 囚禁 6000 多隻熊。今天只有 200 個左右的熊場, 卻囚禁超過 7000 隻熊。毫無跡象顯示中國大陸熊場內的熊隻數量有所減少, 也無跡象顯示中國政府有意關閉熊場工業. 所有跡象表明, 中國熊場工業只是整合成爲少數的寡頭"超級熊場", 每場囚禁上百或上千隻熊。總數相信已超過 7000 隻, 而且許多熊場基於其高獲利, 仍在增加囚禁的熊隻數量。

中國大陸已非法出口大量熊膽汁至許多國家。中國似乎試著改善熊場內的情況以保有合法的國際貿易權, 也才能將這些產品出口至更遙遠的國家。這將導致世界上更多的熊隻被囚禁, 更多的野生熊隻因熊膽而被獵殺。

由中國大陸出口熊膽汁是否爲非法行爲 ？

是的. 中國野生熊類共有三種 : 亞洲黑熊, 亞洲棕熊和馬來熊. (熊場內囚禁的多數爲亞洲黑熊, 但同樣也有亞洲棕熊與馬來熊.) 由於此等中國大陸內的熊類都列於瀕臨絕種野生動植物國際貿易公約 (CITES) 的附錄中, 任何出口都違反了 CITES 與中國法律.

中國大陸是否出口熊膽汁 ？

是的. 雖然中國政府聲稱並無任何熊類器官或內含熊膽汁的產品由中國輸口, 但根據中

國熊場養殖者向 WSPA 訪查人員所透漏，他們將其產品出口至亞洲地區，包括日本，菲律賓，韓國，台灣以及新加坡。此類產品於許多國家中均有販賣。近期 WSPA 調查指出許多於加拿大，美國，新加坡，印尼，馬來西亞，台灣，澳洲和日本的傳統中藥商，均非法販賣由中國出產的熊膽汁。其他涉及熊產品非法貿易的國家包括蘇俄，印度，巴基斯坦與越南。

中國大陸的國際機場內也依然販賣熊膽汁給離境旅客，此為非法行爲。

熊產品交易的利潤爲多少？

熊膽汁的「生意」，獲利很高，國際市場上熊膽汁售價爲每公克美金 15 元至 20 元（中國大陸熊場販賣膽汁的平均價格爲每公克美金 0.21 元）。最高價格出現於日本，某些熊膽汁售價超過每公克美金 252 元。保守估計，中國境內每年熊膽汁市值超過美金一億（以國際平均價格計）。

對於中國熊場「囚熊抽膽」這個議題，WSPA 將採取何種行動？

WSPA 將持續性的藉由調查研究，瞭解飼養熊隻被攝取膽汁時所受的痛苦，以及國際非法熊產品交易的狀況。

WSPA 將在 2002 年 11 月於智利舉辦的 CITES 第 12 屆會員國大會（COP12）會議中提出相關報告。這份題爲《熊膽汁「生意」》的報告，乃是爲期三年，對全球 8 個國家熊類產品貿易所做調查的結果。

WSPA 將促使各國政府以更有效、更嚴謹的方式對國際交易進行管制，促使熊場關閉，方能爲所有熊類提供更佳保護。

資料來源：英國世界動物保護協會（WSPA）

翻譯：台灣動物社會研究會 義工 趙千華/2002.10.28

Q &A 's on China's bear bile farms and the illegal bear trade

WHAT IS BEAR BILE AND WHAT IS IT USED FOR?

Bile is a fluid secreted by the liver and stored in the gall bladder. It is a necessary part of the digestive process. Bear bile has been used in Traditional Chinese Medicine (TCM) for over 3,000 years. It is usually mixed in small amounts with herbs and other products to produce the required TCM used for the treatment of a variety of ailments including stomach and digestive disorders, kidney problems, and internal heat.

WHAT IS BEAR FARMING?

The keeping of bears in captivity, mainly in small cages, with open wounds through which their bile fluids is 'tapped' on a daily basis. Typically, these bears are kept in individual cages measuring around 1m x 1m x 2m. Bears may be kept in these confined cages, where they are often unable to stand upright, for many years.

Bears are 'farmed' for their bile as this enables the farmers' to obtain large amounts of bear bile at a better profit, with a bear being used for its bile for as long as it can be kept alive.

HOW MANY BEARS ARE USED IN BEAR FARMS?

China has around 7,000 bears in about 200 bear farms. **South Korea** has around 1,400 bears left on farms, following a ban by the government several years ago. It is thought that some farmers are illegally breeding and killing their bears for trade.

Vietnam also has bear farms, with an estimated 1,500 bears involved despite the fact that it is illegal to own or farm bears in Vietnam.

HOW IS BILE OBTAINED FROM FARMED BEARS?

In most farms, a metal or plastic tube, or catheter, is surgically inserted directly into the gall bladder to create a channel from gall bladder to the outside of the abdomen. The wound is kept

open with the tube opened and closed to drain the bile. Some farms put a metal corset around the bear's abdomen to prevent the animal from scratching at the tube.

An operation has to be performed to open up the bear and insert the tube into the gall bladder. In many farms, WSPA investigators have found that these operations are generally performed by untrained staff in unhygienic conditions.

Some bear farms use a tissue 'fistula' tube instead of a metal catheter. This causes the bile to seep through to the outside and is termed the "free dripping" method. Bile is drained once or twice a day by inserting a plastic or metal rod or tube into this fistula and draining bile into a bottle or bucket.

WHAT DO FARMERS DO WITH THIS BILE?

Bears are milked once or twice a day to produce around 100 ml of bile from each bear. This dark brown/green liquid is then dried in an oven to form crystals. These are put into small glass tubes and boxed for sale, or the crystals are used to mix with other ingredients in pharmaceutical shops. Many bear farms have their own pharmacies, and market their own brands of bear products for visiting tourists.

HOW DO THE BEARS ON THESE FARMS SUFFER?

Bears are wild animals and to confine them in cages where they cannot even sit up or turn around is undoubtedly inhumane. They have been observed to cry out and tremble when bile is being extracted. After extraction they may scratch or hold their abdomens and rock their heads and bodies around in the cage.

Many bears suffer from surgery related problems such as inflammation around the catheter exit site. Pus, blood and bile often seep from the wounds. Reports from bear farms suggest that 50 to 60% of bears die from complications after operations to insert catheters into the gall bladder. Many of those that survive suffer from infections to the open wounds, tumours, internal abscesses, gallstones, abdominal peritonitis, abdominal hernias, septicaemia, and other related illnesses.

Some bears are de-clawed and have their teeth filed down or removed. Many bears bite the bars of their cages in distress, suffering severe teeth and gum problems as a result.

The diet of the bears is poor, often a corn mash, with a lack of vitamins. Also, water is not readily available.

The Chinese government continues to argue that they are improving animal welfare on bear farms and has several 'model' government bear farms where they claim to have created the best housing facility for farming bears, with small cages for milking the bears but larger cages with outdoor areas attached. However, the outdoor areas are used more for display than for practical use, and during the long winter the bears are confined inside the caged area. The majority of farms still use small cages and WSPA believes that the removal of bile from an animal while it is still alive can never be done humanely.

IS BEAR FARMING A CHINESE TRADITION?

No, bear farms have been operating only since the early 1980's. The Chinese government and bear farm owners repeatedly claim that the use of bear gall bladder and bile products are part of the culture of Traditional Chinese Medicine. According to the Chinese Ministry of Forestry, before 1980, the market demand for bear gall bladder in China was 500 kg per year for the whole of their TCM industry. However, by 1998 the output of dry bile from farms had risen to 7,000 kg a year, of which only 4,000 kg a year is actually used in China.

In recent years, there has been a dramatic growth in the production of bear bile products, which has spawned a market for a whole new range of items, such as shampoo, wine and tea, far removed from the formulations of traditional Chinese medicine.

HOW LONG DO THE BEARS ON THE FARMS LIVE FOR?

Life expectancy is approximately 10 years at best, which is a third of the average age that a bear can live to in the wild.

WHAT ARE THE WILDLIFE CONSERVATION CONCERNS?

The increase in availability of bear bile from bear farms is actually creating an increased demand for the product. Bear bile products are heavily marketed as they are profitable and easy to produce in large quantities. The stimulation of demand for farmed bear bile products is

threatening more wild bear populations, with increased hunting of wild bears as well as those captured from the wild to replace those dying on the farms.

To obtain bear gall bladder, bears have to be killed. The usual method of obtaining bear gall is to hunt them in the wild, as the gall from a wild bear is viewed as being more potent than that of a farmed one. In China, this has helped to reduce wild populations and today, the IUCN Bear Specialist Group estimates there to be only around 20,000 bears in the wild in the whole of China.

ARE THERE ALTERNATIVES TO THE USE OF BEAR BILE?

Yes. Many Chinese Medical Practitioners have claimed that there is no need to use bear bile in TCM in this day and age. There are perfectly adequate and cheaper synthetic alternative products on the market which contain the active constituent found in bear bile i.e. UrsoDeoxyCholic Acid (UDCA). It is estimated that 100,000 kg of synthetic UDCA are already being consumed each year in China, Japan and South Korea, and the world consumption may be double this figure. In addition, there are at least 75 herbal alternatives to bear bile.

IS CHINA CLOSING DOWN BEAR FARMS?

There is no indication that China is planning to reduce the number of bears in farms. In fact it appears that China's intention is to reduce the number of small bear farms in order to have 'super farms' with hundreds or thousands of bears in each.

In the early 1990's there were over 600 bear farms in China holding over 6,000 bears. Today there are around 200 bear farms holding over 7,000 bears!

There is no indication that the number of bears kept in Chinese bear farms is diminishing and no indication that the government is planning to close down the bear farm industry. All indications are that the bear farm industry is being consolidated into a small number of 'super farms' each holding hundreds or over a thousand bears each. There are believed to be over 7000 bears in the farms today but many farms are still increasing the number of bears held in captivity due to the high profits of their industry.

China is already illegally exporting vast quantities of bear bile to many countries. China appears to be trying to improve conditions at bear farms to secure a legal international trade which would allow them to export these products on a far wider scale. This would result in more bears being

farmed around the world and more bears being killed in the wild for the gall bladders.

IS IT ILLEGAL TO EXPORT BEAR BILE FROM CHINA?

Yes. Three species of bear are found in the wild in China, the Asiatic black bear, Asian brown bear, and sun bear. (Most bears kept on farms are Asiatic black bears, but Asian brown bears and sun bears are also used.) Since these bears in China are listed as Appendix I of CITES (Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species), any export would violate CITES and Chinese law.

IS CHINA EXPORTING BEAR BILE?

Yes. The Chinese government claims that neither bear parts nor products, containing bear bile, are exported outside of mainland China. Yet Chinese bear farmers have revealed to WSPA's investigators that they do export their products to Asian regions, including Japan, the Philippines, Korea, Taiwan and Singapore. These products have been found on sale in many countries, and a WSPA investigation recently showed that many TCM shops in Canada, USA, Singapore, Indonesia, Malaysia, Taiwan, Australia and Japan illegally sold bear bile products originating from China. Other countries implicated in the illegal trade of bear products include Russia, India, Pakistan and Vietnam.

International airports in China also continue to sell bear bile products to travellers leaving the country, which is illegal.

HOW MUCH IS THE BEAR TRADE WORTH?

Trade in bear bile products is highly profitable, with bear bile costing around \$15 - \$20 per gram on the international market (in contrast to the average of \$0.24 per gram it is sold for by bear bile farms in China). The highest price found was in Japan, where some bear bile was being sold for over \$252 per gram. Even using conservative estimates, the annual production of bear bile in China is worth in excess of \$100 million (at average international prices).

WHAT IS WSPA DOING ON THE ISSUE OF BEAR FARMS?

WSPA is running an ongoing campaign, along with undercover investigations, to document the suffering of bears farmed for their bile and the illegal international trade in bear products for which they are a major source.

WSPA is presenting a report on this issue to a meeting of CITES (Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species) being held in Chile during November 2002. The report, 'The Bear Bile Business', is based on a three year investigation of the global trade in bear products.

WSPA is lobbying for greater protection for all bear species with more effective and stricter controls on the international trade, as well as the closure of the bear bile farms.

-ends-

For further information, interviews, copies of 'The Bear Bile Business', colour photographs and/or broadcast quality footage, please contact:

Jonathan Owen/Debra Ashton; WSPA 0207 587 5000 (out of hours 07801 386670)